



Higher School of Economics

Igilik D. I.

Mamin I. R.

Kabiken K. K.

Kubaidulla A. A.

Gabduali A. N.

NGOs management: the case of third sector organizations

Thesis submitted for degree of Bachelor in

6B04106 Management

6B04101 Accounting and Audit

6B04104 Finance

Supervisor: Tanekenov A.

Nur-Sultan 2021



Bachelor's Dissertation Review Form

Filled by a Reviewer:

Name and surname: Dr. Lyazat Nurkatova

Job position: Head of the Department of Analysis and Methodological Support

Name of organization: Kazakh Institute for Social Development

Filled by a Student:

Name and Surname: Iglik D. I., Mamin I. R., Kabiken K. K., Kubaidulla

A. A., Gabduali A. N.

Educational programme: HSE

A title of dissertation: **NGOs management: the case of third sector organizations**

This dissertation topic reflects well the acute management issue, specifically, the NGO management challenges in the context of selected Kazakhstanian non profit organizations. The aim of this research was to identify the management challenges faced by local non-profit organizations. In so doing based on analysis both secondary data and also used to analyses the primary data.

In literature review section, the authors have done a thorough research as more than one framework was considered and used. In doing so it captures the literature gap in the field accordingly. Appropriate literature sources were sourced including peer-reviewed journals, books, articles. All definitions to the key words are provided.

Chosen research methodology is an in-depth interview. It fits the purpose and objectives of the research. Interviewed number of respondents is appropriate to achieve saturation. Data was collected properly and aligns with the ethical principles of academic writing.

The research clearly suggests that, firstly, volunteering is the key HRM entrance policy. However, this raises the issue of contract signing with volunteers in the volunteering stage. Additionally, some NGOs note that the challenges with hiring the experienced leadership positions which echoes the point of literature. Yet some NGOs still hire young university graduates with leadership skills to fill the management challenge. Secondly, the inadequate personnel policies or procedures. In contrast to literature, the authors fieldwork showed that many NGOs do not have contracts or job descriptions and that everything depends on the

head and the activities of the NGO. Thirdly, the research showed the lack of HRM is also a major problem for NGOs. Many managers take on HRM responsibilities, but they are not trained to handle the day-to-day responsibilities of the staff, which leads to a conflict between workers after a while.

In conclusion, the authors restate main arguments of the research and summarizes the major findings. Moreover, the author gives recommendations for the case NGOs in the context of the research problem. Conclusion is justified and adequately explained.

As far as the structure and language is concerned, the author uses clear language. When professional terms are used, the author clearly and concisely discloses their meaning. To sum up, this dissertation is a valuable contribution to the academic research. It fills the gap in research on NGOs management issues in Kazakhstan. I recommend the topic of the current dissertation as valuable contribution to the research of the field.

Evaluate the following rubrics on the scale from "Excellent" to "Poor".

	Rubrics	Excellent	Good	Satisfactory	Poor	AdditionalComments
1	Introduction Purpose and objectives of the research are clearly defined. The student demonstrates understanding of the topic. Stated objectives are justified within the scope of the research.	+ + +				
2	Literature Review There is an evidence of appropriate literature selection. The student demonstrates critical assessment of the sources used. The student demonstrates understanding of the gap through evaluation of existing research.	+ + +				
3	Research Question Student identifies research problem and articulates how the research project addresses this problem. Student articulates coherent research	+ +				

	question(s) which will allow to address the research problem adequately.					
4	Research Methodology Chosen research methodology is adequately explained and fit the purpose and objectives of the research.	+				
6	Data collection and analysis Data is collected properly and aligns with the ethical principles discussed in the Master's Dissertation Guidelines	+				
	Appropriate techniques are applied	+				
	Possible biases and gaps are addressed	+				
6	Presentation of the main results and tests The student is able to provide insights on the research problem	+				
	The student reflects on the findings	+				
	Limitations, strengths and weaknesses of the research are defined adequately.	+				
7	Conclusion Conclusion restates main argument(s) of the research	+				
	Conclusion summarizes main findings of the research and conveys their importance to academic and policy community.	+				
	Conclusion provides practical recommendations.	+				
	Conclusion is justified and adequately explained.	+				
8	Structure and Language The student uses clear language and avoid mistakes.					+
	The written text conforms to criteria of academic writing					+



The written text reflects critical writing style +



Date 11/6/2021

Signature [Handwritten Signature]

Please, put a stamp of your organization here.

Calendar plan of completion of the thesis

Stage of work	Deadline according to plan	Actual completion date	Percentage completion	Student signature	Signature of scientific advisor (consultant)
Writing up the introduction	01.02.2021	01.02.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Preparation of a literature review	09.02.2021	09.02.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Elaboration of methodology	18.02.2021	18.02.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Data acquisition and processing	06.03.2021	06.03.2021	100		Tanenkenov A. Aslan
Analysis and interpretation of the results	19.03.2021	19.03.2021	100		Tanenkenov A. Aslan
Elaboration of recommendations on the work where relevant	03.04.2021	03.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A. Aslan
Writing a conclusion	05.04.2021	05.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Thesis completion	12.04.2021	12.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Supervisor's feedback	14.04.2021	14.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.
Preparation of the report, visual aids and presentations	16.04.2021	16.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A. Aslan
Thesis presentation	22.04.2021	22.04.2021	100		Tanenkenov A.

Supervisor: Tanenkenov Aslan

ABSTRACT

The growing number of non-governmental organizations in recent years indicates the demand for improving the social conditions of vulnerable members of society, and activities related to the environment. However, with a high number of these organizations, it is more apparent the internal and external management issues, mainly related to human resource management. The finding in this area showed the common challenges of NGO Management and the development of sustainable NGOs. The main goal was to find the realities and state of affairs of NGOs in Kazakhstan. We used targeted interviews with the members of various NGOs in Kazakhstan to find: a) the correlations of each result with Batti's challenges on NGO Management; b) the main issues for NGOs in Kazakhstan. The questions were prepared with a focus on career growth opportunities, financial possibilities, and conflicts within the organization. The literature states that hiring and retaining competent workers, insufficient social packages, and wage distribution are problems for NGOs. However, the research showed mixed findings. When comparing the results with Batti's challenges, the conclusions are correlated and mixed. The results illustrate the modern problem for NGOs in Kazakhstan. Firstly, HR usually is not capable of giving traineeship and career development opportunities because of dependence on funds from the government and international funds. Secondly, NGOs mostly operate with short-term projects and have fewer incentives to keep employees longer. Lastly, NGOs are not popular among citizens, hence the local business sector is not inclined to financially support them with funds, which is common practice in Europe. The additional sources from the business will increase the operations and recognition of NGOs for the long term.

Table of contents

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	5
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1. The development of nonprofit organizations in Kazakhstan.....	8
2.2. Development NGO's as «Third Sector» organizations	11
2.3. NGOs management in Russian Federation	15
2.4. Theorizing the management of non- governmental development organizations	19
2.5. Human Resource: issues of local NGOs Management	34
CHAPTER 3: PRIMARY DATA	41
3.1. Fieldwork Analysis #1 and #2.....	41
3.2. Fieldwork Analysis #3 and #4.....	44
3.3. Fieldwork Analysis #5 and #6.....	45
3.4. Fieldwork Analysis #7 and #8.....	48
3.6. Fieldwork Analysis #9 and #10.....	50
CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSIONS	53
4.1. Recommendations.....	56
BIBLIOGRAPHY	57
Appendix A.....	63

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Overview of NGOs

Overview of NGOs

The analysis used the theory from the paper by Miles and Snow (1984), which demonstrated four human resource management structures: lawyers; analysts; prospectors; and reactors. Based on this, it can be said that human resource management is of great importance in the NGO sector in Kazakhstan. Especially for the category of researchers, professionals and human rights defenders. Kazakhstan's NGO sector is diverse in terms of activities and geography. NGOs provide a wide variety of programs, from education and health care to the recovery of persons with disabilities. Special attention is paid to NGOs in the fields of education, children's and youth policy and culture. Sex, legal, and social issues are also discussed by many involved NGOs (Buxton, 2011). Geographically, in the southern part of the state, the bulk of NGOs work in Almaty, followed in the footsteps of the eastern and northern parts of the state. There is a small number of NGOs recorded in Western Kazakhstan. The number and configuration of nongovernmental organizations registered in a given geographic area depend on the size of the population and the degree of investment in that area. For instance, the huge number of foreign plans concentrated in Almaty (USAID, 2011) influences the increase in the number of NGOs there. It is estimated that 42% of Kazakhstan's NGOs give public proposals (education, health and culture), 24% campaign for the interests of socially disadvantaged communities, and 34% concentrate on human rights, environmental and gender problems for lawmakers (USAID 2010). In reality, a sample survey of 271 NGOs in 2009 recommended that the middle category of NGOs consider urban residents to be end-users of their own proposals, while the remaining 50 percent included rural residents, district municipalities, district companies, national governments and international organizations (Kabdieva Aliya, 2008, Makhmutova & Akhmetova, 2011). Most NGO heads and staff are women. Primarily an excellent group of women, according to Starr (2011), dominates volunteerism in Central Asia. In the main areas of women's well-being, almost all women's NGOs are involved, including assistance for the financial development of women, support for specific municipal programs and assistance to women who have been victims of violence. Kazakhstan's women's

NGOs, led by the Feminist League, the Girlfriend Crisis Center and others, influence government politicians and prepare reports for international agencies (Buxton, 2011). Almost all individuals, particularly women with leadership and management skills, have achieved self-realization and professional development through joining an NGO (Abdusalyamova & Warren, 2007).

Nearly all organisations are inactive and exist on paper only. (Kazakhstan's non-governmental organizations: 20 years of formation, 2011). In general, as suggested by Miles and Snow (1984), the main task of HRM in terms of human resource management is to continue recruiting, raising and redistributing human funds. If HRM begins to incorporate a high-spirited employee turnover, they intend to see high-spirited employee turnover. If HRM begins to incorporate a flexible array of layouts into recruiting and hiring in the new area of money, they plan to see high-spirited employee turnover. They will attribute the least value to HRM within their own personal policies and future guidance. The low level of understanding of the community about the work of NGOs is one of the reasons for this story, and another root cause is the inaccessibility of NGO employees' ability to recognise and meet voters' needs. NGOs often partly reconcile their own fields of programming with society's desires and preferences. A new research, for instance, has shown that more than 50% of the population is currently waiting for NGO jobs in the field of children and youth. At the same time, at least 15% of the country's NGOs are likely to be involved in children's and youth programs (USAID, 2010). In 2011, the consolidated NGO resilience index was 4.1, which simply reveals an average degree of formation (USAID, 2011). This talks about the fact that both groups, components of the index, have a big need to change. In order to enhance the characteristics of NGOs in all related areas of development, managerial capability in these areas, such as finance, government collaboration, market and human capital, needs to be improved.

The *non-governmental organization (NGO)* is a non-profit organization that helps people, protects the environment, and is not regulated by the government (LONGMAN, last updated).

The *third sector* is a part of society, which includes non-governmental organizations, as well as organizations that are engaged in charity, volunteer and public organizations (LEXICO, last updated).

Research aim: The aim of our research work is to identify the management challenges faced by local non-profit organizations. Our work and field research focuses on gaps in the organizational system and HR structure within the NGO. The subject of discussion will be the tasks and difficulties facing NGOs, with regard to the most important component of any organization, it is a human resource.

Objectives:

1. Review the secondary data and develop a theoretical framework of the subject.
2. Collect the primary data and extract key information on HRM challenges in NGOs.
3. Analyze qualitative data from interviews among employees in the sector.
4. Establish the current management challenges and propose recommendations.

Research Methodology: According to the analysis of the study, compared to Batti's theory, we interviewed 10 respondents from NGOs in Kazakhstan. Among the interviewed respondents, there are 4 men and 6 women. By geolocation, 3 are located in the city of Nur-Sultan, 1 in the city of Almaty, 2 in the city of Kyzylorda, 1 in the city of Aktobe, 1 in the city of Petropavlovsk, 1 in the city of Kostanay, and 1 in the city of Atbasar. The respondents were both young and older generations from 25 to 60 years old.

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. The development of nonprofit organizations in Kazakhstan

For the development of non-profit organizations, financing is one of the important segments, as for other organizations, companies. Grants from international donors are the main funding sources for NGOs (Hongjin Zhu, Pengji Wang, Chris Bart, 2016). However, according to the latest data, such types of financing are declining (Makhmutova & Akhmetova, 2011). There are a number of nonprofit organizations that have multiple sources of funding. Such as, government agencies, international organizations, private businesses, other Kazakhstani nonprofit organizations, foreign companies, Kazakhstani businesses and banks, religious groups, and nonprofit organizations from neighboring countries.

Cooperation of non-profit organizations with the state. According to Kazakhstan's Civil Alliance (2009), nonprofit organizations should be financially independent of foreign donors, and the government is likely to be a major source of funding. In 2011, overall support for government social contracts amounted to more than 2 billion tenge, or around 13.5 million dollars, compared to 1.9 billion tenge in 2010. (USAID, 2011).

Government funding affects the effectiveness of the activities of NGOs in Kazakhstan (Diachenko, 2008; Makhmutova & Akhmetova, 2011). The low level of government support in the 1990s resulted in Kazakhstan's NGOs beginning to pursue comprehensive assistance from foreign sources, mainly from financial sources.

Civic forums were organized to strengthen cooperation between the State and non-profit organizations. The first forum was held in 2003. The aim of the forum was to develop a new partnership model between the government, industry, and nonprofit sectors. Two years later, in 2005, the second Civil Forum was organized to create a civil alliance of NGOs, introduce a system of state social order and develop proposals for interaction between NGOs and the business sector (Diachenko, 2008). In 2007, the third civil society forum was held, where the ministers publicly announced their cooperation with NGOs. After this forum, projects were implemented in various areas, which are funded by the state (Committee on

Civil Society Affairs). The fourth Civic Forum was held in all regions of the country, and for this reason, it became the main event. And in 2011, was organized the fifth forum.

The civil society forums held have led to the strengthening of cooperation between NGOs and the state. The most important source of funding for nonprofit organizations in Kazakhstan is currently state social contracts. Data from the state grants provided to NGOs in 2017-2020 were obtained for the report, as summarized in Table 2.1.1.

Table 2.1.1 State grants for NGOs, 2017-2020

	2017	2018	2019	2020
	<i>Funding amount (mln tenge)</i>			
Total	612,5	911,9	1 059,5	1 834,6
Protection of the rights and legitimate interests of citizens and organizations. Increased engagement of NGOs in the decision-making process and improving the sustainability of NGOs	203,1	333,3	446,7	395,1
Strengthening social harmony and national unity. The de-radicalization of society	175,4	176,5	77,3	214,2
Support for orphans, children from single-parent and large families. Protection of children's rights	110,0	133,8	59,9	55,1
Support for young people's policy and children's initiatives	40,0	144,5	423,1	554,1
Health care of citizens, promotion of a healthy lifestyle	20,0	39,5	30,0	53,0
Support for socially vulnerable segments of the population	19,0	3,0	3,0	114,6
Achieving goals in the field of education, science, information, physical culture and sports	10,0	19,7	10,0	231,5
Environmental protection	10,0	19,7		68,2
Solving gender problems	10,0	12,8	4,0	66,0

Support in the employment of citizens	10,0	8,3		
Protection of historical and cultural heritage	5,0	20,9		55,6
Support to probation services in providing social and legal support to persons registered with them			5,4	27,3

Sources: Committee for Civil Society Affairs of the Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2017-2020).

As indicated in Table 2.1.1 above, state grants for NGOs are increasing. In 2020, the total support for state social contracts amounted to more than 1.8 billion tenge, compared to 0.6 billion tenge in 2017.

Based on the above data it can be noted that the majority of NGOs in Kazakhstan carry out their activities in the following areas:

- Support for socially vulnerable segments of the population;
- Physical education and sports;
- Protection of the rights and legitimate interests of citizens and organizations;
- Support for youth policy and children's initiatives;
- Education and science.

There are a number of examples where cooperation between nonprofit organizations and the state has led to positive results. Nevertheless, they also have disadvantages.

According to local activists of nonprofit organizations (Ruffin, 2011), in Kazakhstan, the government does not consider nonprofit organizations as strong partners and underestimates their potential. This significantly decreases the prospects in Kazakhstan for the growth of nonprofit organizations. As mentioned above, international donors are also sources of funding for NGOs, in addition to government grants.

The most active foreign organizations are the US Agency for International Development (USAID), the Soros Foundation-Kazakhstan (SFK), Freedom House, and the National Endowment for Democracy (NED).

Grants given by international donors are growing, just like state grants, as summarized in Table 2.1.2.

Table 2.1.2 International donors' grants for NGOs, 2017-2020

	2017	2018	2019	2020
	<i>Funding amount (mln tenge)</i>			
Total	392,0	785,7	704	1140,6
Soros Foundation-Kazakhstan	296,6	483,4	474,1	566,6
National Endowment for Democracy		262,7	229,9	574,0
USAID	95,4	39,6		

Sources: Soros Foundation-Kazakhstan (last updated).

National Endowment for Democracy (last updated).

Eurasia Foundation of Central Asia (last updated).

As indicated in Table 2.1.2 above, international donors grants for NGOs in 2017 were amounted to approximately 0.4 billion tenge compared to 1.1 billion tenge in 2020.

Strategic management of human resources has an effect on the organization's efficacy. Nonprofit organization leaders are always enterprising individuals, but they need the right skills and experience to run organizations (Cooper, 2011). Nonprofit organizations need to develop organizational structures in the field of human resources in Kazakhstan. The shortage of trained managers and skilled employees and volunteers is one of the biggest challenges. The most significant factor leading to poor growth and inefficiency, according to 25% of respondents, is a lack of qualified and educated staff, and 31% cited the lack of volunteerism as one of the reasons for the country's slow growth of non-governmental organizations (Diachenko, 2008). There is a need to improve human resource management through training programs for key employees. Training is considered to be the most important way for employees with the aim of obtaining the knowledge, skills and attitudes to perform his job. Organizations must invest heavily in on-the-job training and quality development in order to remain successful (Benevene & Cortini, 2010).

2.2. Development NGO's as «Third Sector» organizations

All attempts to study the management of a public organization begin with an analysis of how it is possible to turn a public organization into a special category. This is a difficult task, as this area has a lot of confusion in terminology and concept. In this chapter, it can be noted that public organizations take their peculiarity from two aspects. First, they are different from the first and second types of organizations, since their task is not profit and they are not related to politics. Secondly, the main task of the third sector is "Development", which means: poverty reduction, heritage, art, culture and recreation. All attempts to study the management of a public organization begin with an analysis of how it is possible to turn a public organization into a special category. This is a difficult task, as this area has a lot of confusion in terminology and concept. In this chapter, it can be noted that public organizations take their peculiarity from two aspects. First, they are different from the first and second types of organizations, since their task is not profit and they are not related to politics. Secondly, the main task of the third sector is "Development", which means: poverty reduction, heritage, art, culture and recreation.

The idea of a third sector comes from Etzioni (1961) work on organizational differences. Etzioni studied different types of organizations and based on this was able to make the concept of three types of organizations. This idea is that it is determined who has power and over whom it is exercised. People can be in an organization under the exercise of power over their means under the threat of physical sanctions, remuneration, and control over the financial situation of an employee. Etzion and believes that in every organization, one of the forms is dominant.

Third-sector organizations use power to achieve their goals, as they need the loyalty of their employees and this entails remuneration, not the main source of income. This idea led to the idea of a "free" organization in contrast to the first and second sectors, which are bound by value-oriented ideas and commitments. Najam (1996) as an idea of iconic can be used to prove that there are great differences between the three sectors. In the 90s, this concept was widely recognized in the world. Solomon and Anheier (1999) suggested that there are five key properties in an organization:

1. Organization and institutional reality.
2. A private organization separate from the government.

3. Do not return profits to owners and directors.
4. Broad control over its activities.
5. Voluntary participation and management.

Solomon and Anheier (1999) showed the economic and social importance of the third sector in the industrial and developed countries of the world. The development of public organizations can be considered as a separate subgroup of the third sector, which have a number of common structural and motivational elements in management, the purpose of which is to reduce poverty. They are formed from different groups of organizations in industrialized countries, but mainly work in the foreign market as Oxfam. Public organizations can include small companies, as well as large ones with their own motivation. Due to the fact that third-sector organizations have a major focus on development, they face special challenges. Development management has become a separate area whose goal is to achieve success in social areas that will empower the poor in society. This style of government can be associated with broad social and economic changes with the personal development of people and their potential.

Awareness of the importance of roles, norms and values is not the main task of the third sector. From the moment Peters and Waterman (1992) began to argue that in order for an organization to succeed, it was necessary to create its own corporate culture, realize its mission, and have an interest in its own business. Walton (1985) believes that the transition from a controlling management style to a loyal one has a positive impact on employees, as it directly affects their remuneration system.

In addition to the importance of values in the management of the third sector, the difficulty of managing conflicts and the division of opinions also opened up a problem. Paton (1999) showed that excessive commitment to the company's ideas can lead to a "dark side", where employees can excessively use their official powers for their own personal purposes. If you pay high attention to the definition of values in the management of the third sector helps to determine the clarity of the concept of management and help in explaining its complexity and ambiguity

The importance of the role of values and rewards in the company as described in Etzioni's (1961) ideas requires that public organizations go beyond the boilerplate methods of management, as opposed to

commercial and state-owned enterprises. Most third-sector companies have come to this method of management independently and voluntarily, because there are several reasons for this. The expressive element of the third sector can act as an obstacle to the promotion of any structured management reflections.

Many NGOs have been founded as “alternative” institutions that see governance as an orthodox, central problem from which they attempt to differentiate themselves.

Others clearly stressed a "culture of action" in which there is no space beyond the underlying execution for structured management ideas. Being mainly casual and people-centered, it is unnecessary for many such NGOs to pay serious attention to their organizational aspects.

In recent years, for many reasons, the reluctance to engage in management has started to vanish. There are several organizations within the larger development NGO community that increasingly realize that more of their organizational structures and personnel will be required for the complexities of the development 'task' and the demands of organizational growth and expansion that may follow small-scale or local success. Beyond just the usual “confusion” practice. Some organizations go through many phases of the life cycle of the organization and reach a point of maturity where it takes on a deeper sense to think about management, such as the need to learn from some common errors. In the case of development NGOs sponsored by foreign development donors, many of these funding agencies are now requiring organizations to create organizational structures capable of providing quality work, from funding requirements to more transparent NGO-focused capacity building initiatives. This, perhaps, ironically, has contributed to another explanation why some of these types of NGOs, as they might literally come in the form of external imposition or circumstance, resist management ideas and advice.

As of April 2020, according to the Ministry of Information and Public Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, there are 22,344 NGOs in our country, of which only 16,426 organizations are active. In Table 2.2.1 provides more detailed information on the regions and the status of NPOs in Kazakhstan.

Table 2.2.1 Number of NGO’s by regions, 2020

Region, city	Number of NGOs	Suspended	Inactive	Stage of liquidation	Bankrupt	Active
Total	22 344	2 096	810	678	16	16 426
Nur-Sultan city	2 996	230	172	60	2	2 453
Almaty city	5 343	526	284	104	4	3 178
Shymkent city	1 177	113	48	19	0	865
Akmola region	734	79	19	35	0	517
Aktobe region	727	70	13	44	1	549
Almaty region	1 213	121	21	54	0	892
Atyrau region	627	41	33	11	1	536
East Kazakhstan region	1 265	177	25	55	0	927
Jambyl region	1 071	152	26	23	0	760
West Kazakhstan region	704	65	34	31	0	543
Karaganda region	1 492	143	51	45	0	1 117
Kostanay region	779	113	13	47	0	581
Kyzylorda region	1 164	96	7	39	0	1 009
Mangystau region	856	27	17	52	1	671
Pavlodar region	892	72	29	17	6	693
North Kazakhstan region	495	47	6	31	1	393
Turkistan region	809	24	12	11	0	742

Sources: Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020).

2.3. NGOs management in Russian Federation

Russian Federation divided NGO by creating sub-division of Socially Oriented Non-Profit Organizations (SONKO). The budget and funds are allocated only for those NGOs, who were selected as part of SONKO. It was created in 2008 as part of the economic development for social means.

Although all information was available publicly, some data in these reports were repeated and misleading.

Federal budget allocations to support SONKO were increased in real terms by 59.3%, from 21.8 bln rubles in 2018 to 34.7 bln rubles in 2019.

Table 2.3.1 State grants for NGO's provided by SONKO, 2010-2019

Year	<i>Funding amount</i>
Total	119,8 bln rubles – 671,06 bln tenge
2010	3,9 bln rubles – 21,85 bln tenge
2011	5 bln rubles – 28,01 bln tenge
2012	4,7 bln rubles – 26,33 bln tenge
2013	8,3 bln rubles – 46,49 bln tenge
2014	8,1 bln rubles – 45,37 bln tenge
2015	11,3 bln rubles – 63,30 bln tenge
2016	9,1 bln rubles – 50,97 bln tenge
2017	12,9 bln rubles – 72,26 bln tenge
2018	21,8 bln rubles – 122,11 bln tenge
2019	34,7 bln rubles – 194,37 bln tenge

Sources: Rossiskaya Gazeta (2013).

Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2014-2019).

In 2019, compared to 2018, the number of SONCOs engaged in the following activities increased: prevention of social orphanhood, support of motherhood and childhood - by 11%; environmental protection and animal protection - by 11%; improving the quality of life of elderly people - by 6%; activities in the field of volunteering - by 7%; support of socially significant youth initiatives, projects, children's and youth movements, children's and youth organizations - by 6%; charitable activities - by 3%.

In 2019, more than 44.5 bln rubles were transferred to 5.8 thousand SONCOs, which provided services to more than 19 million Russian citizens.

Table 2.3.2 Summary of Funding for SONKO at the federal level, 2015-2019

State body of the Russian Federation providing financial support to SONKO	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
	<i>Funding amount (mln rubles)</i>				
Total	7 102,12	9 993,1	10 292,87	21 872,71	34 634,4
Administrative Department of the President of the Russian Federation	4 228,2	4 589,9	6 653,8	7 800,0	7 700,0
Ministry of Labor of Russia	765,6	2 320,4	1 319,2	2 294,2	2 086,7
Russian Emergency Situations Ministry	100,0	90,0	90,0	88,2	90,0
Ministry of Science	-	86,4	-	7 664,7	13 550,3
Ministry of Culture of Russia	2 007,3	2 753,2	2 115,3	2 487,3	9 906,0
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	-	-	-	174,6	246,4
The Federal Agency for Nationalities	1,02	-	-	1 282,9	1 055,0
Rospechat	-		1,07	12,01	-
Rosmolodezh	-	153,2	113,5	68,8	-

Sources: Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2015-2019).

Information on the implementation of the Package of Measures aimed at ensuring step-by-step access of SONKOs operating in the social sphere to budget funds allocated for the provision of social services to the population for 2017-2019 in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

Table 2.3.3 Summary information on the implementation of the Package of Measures in the context of social sectors, 2017-2019

Social sectors	2017	2018	2019
	<i>Funding amount (bln rubles)</i>		
Total	24 653,3	31 317,9	44 544,4
Social protection and social services	5 823,2	11 212,4	13 069,9
Education	7 424,4	8 117,1	9 707,8

Culture	3 853,2	2 867,4	7 943,0
Healthcare	644,7	353,0	416,5
Physical culture	6 310,9	7 759,1	12 045,5
Youth policy	596,9	1 008,9	1 361,7

Sources: Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2017-2019).

The total amount of funds transferred by the constituent entities of the Russian Federation to SONKO for the implementation of these areas in 2019 amounted to more than 44.5 bln rubles. These funds were distributed among 5.8 thousand SONCOs, whose services were received by more than 19 million people (in 2017, more than 22 bln rubles were distributed among 4.4 thousand SONCOs, whose services were received by more than 3 million people).

By 2003, at the time of the survey, about 570 thousand non-profit organizations already existed in Russia. The research figures may differ from the 8,500 non-profit organizations registered in Russia by 1993, 160,000 by 1997, and approximately 275,000 in 2000. The number of registered NGOs in the Russian Federation may differ depending on the year and can and can be considered only as a rough estimate, due to the unavailability of official information and, to some extent, the unreliability of secondary informants in the Russian Federation or abroad. The very concept of "non-governmental organizations" is often subject to broad interpretation, and organizations can be viewed in different ways, as a result of which divergences occur. For example, analytical data taken from the official website of Goskomstat includes organizations such as foundations and charitable organizations, consumer groups and municipal organizations, which the term non-profit organizations itself does not apply to.

By 2015, we see a large increase in the number of registered NGOs in Russia, despite conflicting estimates. Based on the estimates provided for Sarah Henderson's research team in 1993 and 1997, calculations were made. In the course of the study, 4 different approximate indicators were obtained using the linear regression method for 2005: 616344, 465005, 771424 and 370148. The number of NGOs registered in the Russian Federation by 2005 averaged 555 730. In the same way, by 2000 this the figure is 328050 and by 1996 it is about 133756. However, working with accurate official data is much more

effective than with evaluative analytics. According to the law on regulating the activities of NGOs, all organizations must register with the Ministry of Justice, but there is no such information in official sources.

NGO problems in Russian Federation

Domestic lawmakers have introduced a bill banning the funding of border-based NGOs' political service, which also considers their re-municipal registration. Critics of the bill claim that such measures would lead to the closing of Russian branches of foreign NGOs and further restriction of the country's civilian energy supply. Alexey Ostrovsky, the deputy who put forward the Liberal Democratic Party bill, said that, in reality, if it were adopted, it would be prohibited for non-governmental organizations to obtain funding from foreign sponsors that can be used in the Russian Federation to organize the "orange" revolution. John Squier assumes that while international NGOs play a major role,

They have a place in the Russian Federation and are hardly prepared to oppose the government or affect the final results of the vote.

"He believes that before all this, the adoption of the law will harm the Russian Federation's civilian energy: "The law would limit the work of branches of any foreign organization or foundation in the Russian Federation. This will allow the government to decide what work is feasible and have an opportunity to communicate with non-governmental organizations. "The government can further tighten the control of civilian society in this way." During a meeting with President Putin, some opponents of the bill called on President Bush to raise the issue. Other claim that the Russian Federation is not now considered a totalitarian state, unlike the Russian Union, and that, consequently, the Russians are obliged to address this issue autonomously.

2.4. Theorizing the management of non- governmental development organizations

There have been a number of researches conducted in the area of NGO Management. The following literature covered major finding in the field of Human Resource and Theories. Human resource management as an integral function is designed to maximize the efficiency of personnel in serving the

strategic goals of the employer. (C. Batti) HRM primarily focuses on the management of people in organizations, highlighting as the dominant HRM policies and HRM systems

In the real world, there is no difference between human resource strategy and business strategy. A successful business owner understands the strong bond between the two. Progressive human capital is essential for longevity and business success. Human Resource Strategy today includes executive leadership teams providing specialists in their field to improvise additional goals in HRM and the overall business. To do this, we studied a number of standard and most important theories in the field of HRM regarding non-profit organizations, and in this article, we will cover each of them.

The first Theory of Resource Dependence is based on the principle that an Organization, such as a business firm, must engage in transactions with other participants and organizations in its environment in order to obtain resources. While such transactions can be beneficial, they can also create dependencies that do not exist. The resources an organization needs may be scarce, not always available, or controlled by unwilling parties. Unequal exchange can lead to differences in governance, authority, and free access to a wide range of resources.

The theory of competitive advantage, cited by Michael Porter, states that public and private enterprises, as well as the state itself, must implement policies that promote the creation of high quality and competitive goods for export at high prices in market activities. Focusing on increasing productivity growth, Porter cites an example in national strategies. Porter's theory is fundamentally based on the fact that natural resources are not a guarantee of a good economic environment, but cheap labor is ubiquitous. The values of any company are a basic element of its corporate culture. It is the values that largely determine the rules and norms of behavior, the principles of work performance and interaction with colleagues and clients, which means that the performance of the entire team depends on the values. Therefore, the formulation, description and further implementation of values is an important matter. Moreover, given the working values, the corporate culture of the company can even become its competitive advantage: employees (real and potential) will dream of working in such a company, and

clients and partners - to work with it. It is precisely the importance of norms of values and mission that Institutional Theory tells us.

Agency theory tells us that managers and shareholders should introduce a system of screening and monitoring the performance of their staff. The theory says that agents performing work can be inconvenient for pre-donors, since they do not have regulatory activities. Monitoring performance and setting priorities to ensure that these goals are achieved, ambiguity must be removed and all legal aspects of the relationship must be adhered to.

General systems theory is a special-scientific and logical-methodological concept of researching objects that are systems. General systems theory is closely related to the systems approach and is a concretization and logical and methodological expression of its principles and methods.

The theory of the life cycle of the organization speaks of the relationship between human resource management with the growth stage of the organization. Since any organization grows, develops over time, life cycle theory fully embodies this connection. This theory also bears similarities with the strategy of Miles and Snow (1978), as they believed that the growth of organizations is directly related to the improvement of the effectiveness of human resource management. Each organization has a pyramid, a hierarchy of employees, according to certain responsibilities and ranks. Role behavior theory is also used in the organization as a means of sending role information, and they determine the role response. Human resource management should focus on improving role information for employees so that each employee has their own role and responsibilities. Batti mentions, that human resource management should also focus on the theory of organizational change. Because over time, all organizations, like people, go through different forms, levels of quality and conditions. This theory is also similar to the typology of Miles and Snow (1978). As mentioned earlier, human resource management is directly related to a company's strategy. For this reason, human resource management must ensure consistency between the goals, changes and results of non-profit organizations. All this leads to some kind of specific economic costs, so the Theory of transaction costs tells us about an economic perspective on management structures in business operations. The theory takes into account the costs of creating, monitoring,

evaluating and enforcing contracts. Since managers working in an organization have limited information to make decisions before committing transactions, measures must be taken to reduce risks. Human resource management should minimize contract review, monitoring and enforcement of established goals, objectives and standards. Managers should look for opportunities that employees can use. Likewise, organizations must adopt several strategic typologies as stated in the strategic theory of contingencies. Human resource management should depend on the specific typology of the organizational environment chosen. For each case, there must be a way out and a solution. The success and growth of an organization requires ongoing employee training. Organizational Learning Theory says that human resource management must provide lifelong learning so that learning helps in the development of the employee and her company.

The discourse of NGO's operations can be made by deconstructing NGO development and their close examination. It is clear that the environment in which NGOs perform is a critical key in this deconstruction. Several development-related NGOs operate in a risky and highly unstable environment with disintegrated governments, which skeptical of NGOs presence. Additionally, NGOs deal with a variety of cultures, which can be a challenge in creating a healthy workplace for individuals with different backgrounds. Aid industry and their political and geographical difficulties are also key aspects of understanding NGOs' work. Finally, it is necessary to understand taken activities and projects in creating the development of such institutions. All these can be divided into three categories: the internal operations and organization of NGOs; the relationships with the external environment; the Ngo's actions towards development.

Environment

The geopolitical position of most NGOs is culturally diverse, governmentally compound, and limited in resources. This can be said especially in areas where the government is unstable, which can lead to poor communication and issues in gaining accurate information. Moreover, without proper management encounters among NGO workers and local people may lead to cultural tensions. On the other hand, NGOs

become more complex internally with the employment of diverse staff, thus HR strategies such as “Management of diversity” becoming more common in the workplace.

Although “globalization” is bringing positive economic and social changes, it also creates many issues that management should solve. NGOs are now adapting to this new system, binding local issues such as poverty and working with international organizations to reduce structural entities that creates the environment, which leads to poverty. High number of NGOs in the “aid industry” are in a group of international, multilateral, inter-governmental donors for humanitarian prospects. Many of them work alongside other organizations, receive funds, and create long and short-term projects. This cooperation leads to several internal and external issues for NGOs. For instance, Southern NGOs complain about the high volatility of donor trends: from civil rights to protection of the environment. The second problem lies in administrative issues. Many donors work with contractors, replacing some management staff of NGOs, which is negative in long-term management. Similarly, many donors support only projects instead of core costs. This creates miscommunication between NGOs and donors, making it difficult to work on “projects” without donations that cover operational expenses.

Southern and Northern NGOs key goals are forming “alliances” with each other to create a healthy operating environment. SNGO has difficulties with role allocation, which requires equality. Northern NGO has issues with verifying their legality to all members that are linked to both organizations. NNGO had several main transformations since the end of the 90s, all linked to environmental policies. Firstly, there has been the shift from an independent approach of working with projects towards cooperation and partnerships with other institutions. Secondly, findings’ allocation and distribution from SNGOs, as there were instances of funding by-passing NNGO. Lastly, new priority on emergency, which highlighted its role in the 90s. These changes affected NNGO's whole system, as many of them faced an “identity crisis”. They found themselves in the middle of organizations with different goals, projects, and countries. Development NGOs had trouble balancing and distinguishing projects that were risky or innovative. Aid related NGOs was at risk with new donors with ideas that were not planned by NGOs themselves. The

main obstacle for NGO management is to have more control in adapting to a new environment and have space in managing projects.

Activities

The projects that were implemented by NGOs are highly varied but can be summarized by three activities: partnership, implementation, and catalysis. NGO can work in these activities simultaneously, or switch from one to another when it is necessary to take immediate action. Korten (1987) in his studies has confirmed, that initially established NGOs' core agenda is to assist people in need, such as victims after a hurricane disaster. However, over time, NGOs intend to establish cooperation with the government and companies with long-term sustainable development projects. The implementation activities include quick resource mobilisation of goods and resources of NGO's projects, or that were funded by government or donors. These resources cover many areas of aid, from healthcare to emergency relief. Before the '90s, they provided little to no services being provided to the public. However, later on, started to work with governments to provide services and strengthen their perception. This helped the contracting of NGOs by donors and government for special projects, this broadened the popularity of NGOs. For instance, BRAC has several primary schools across Bangladesh and has become a key partner of the government. BRAC has grown in size and has developed a strong and well-trained staff. Thus, as catalysts, NGOs can inspire and contribute to a much broader scale of people. These actions will help other NGOs to cooperate with the government, be able to develop strategies for future projects. In some places, some NGOs have been viewed as main service suppliers, hence, forgetting the main goal of emergency against catastrophes and poverty. Others see these organizations as innovators in policy-making, which then will be implemented by the government. It is widely common that NGOs develop both short-term and long-term projects. As an example, NGO located in the Philippines created agricultural technologies to reduce soil erosion, and after the successful launch and farmers' support, the Government and other NGOs adopted this project. The idea of partnership now becomes a challenge for NGOs, as it means complex relationships and possible dependency and absorption. This also creates an issue with financing and accountability, as many stakeholders are taken into account. Poor balancing between donors and fund allocation leads to NGO

limitation and future development. As such, NNGO has formed a network, where each NGO can share their operations to support the relationship and transparency.

Relationships

The relationship is an important part of every NGO. These organizations cover a much broader area of influence than a typical institution. NGOs are highly dependent on the surrounding environment and events that occur daily. As NGO scales up, it needs more connections to other organizations to operate more efficiently. De Graaf states three concentric circles of influence. The first is internal features like accounting, planning, goals, projects, and staffing. The second one is external and covers much broader influence, such as cooperation, collaboration, lobbying. These strategies can be used while working with governments, donors, and other NGOs. The third is the relationship with political structures, technological and macro-economic environment. This indicates how NGO management uses its strategic values to influence a wider perspective of economic and political operations. These three influences can be inter-related and with wise decisions be beneficial in the long-term. For example, NGO can develop a project related to water supply for communities with resource scarcity. After successful training and planning, NGO can then lobby the government and donors for collaboration. In the long-term, international organizations and technological advancement will be used to support the initial NGO's project.

Organization

NGOs require people with different knowledge and skills to set up and maintain their work: project managers, planners, website developers, fundraisers and survey organizers, and so on. However, first of all, the organization needs leaders - people who are committed to the ideology of the organization and who want to spend time and effort on the implementation of its activities. The management team usually comprises the executive director, senior management and the board of directors. NGO leaders bear the overall responsibility of ensuring that the task of the NGO is straightforward, that services are successful and that resources are distributed effectively. Stark Biddle's earlier empirical study of NGOs (1984) also supports Dichter's (1989) hypothesis that modern NGO managers invest more time to "trendy" ideas rather than really important aspects of organizing the organization of an enterprise, such as hiring

competent staff. , planning and budgeting their distribution and provision of efficient systems for servicing their vehicles and optimization of the process.

Let us now discuss Fowler's (1997) theory, which argues that the main problem of NGO growth is the incorrect setting of goals and a strong distinction between NGO mission, strategy and values. When its leaders achieve an understanding of core values, share a shared vision for change and set clearly established goals, an NGO is most likely to be successful. Otherwise - clearly without defined values, vision and goals, NGOs will lack a “moral” compass to determine the right decisions. Without a clear vision, inspiring others to participate will be challenging. Without clearly defined goals, it is impossible to determine the direction and the most important aspects of the activity, which should be paid attention to. Such an organization is more likely to be involved in projects that have little or no connection to the community for which they are intended.

First, in all aspects of its work, an NGO must adhere to a certain system of values and principles. Accountability and transparency are two common values for all NGOs. The NGO should discuss and agree on all other image aspects. Some define values that are relevant to the quality of their work, while others define their values based on interactions with partners and society, or those that say something about their vision of the world. Second, the NGO Vision Strategy is a powerful tool for motivating staff and volunteers and encouraging others to join you. The strategic mission of an NGO is divided into two parts. The first part is a description of the key goals - which we discussed above, as well as a correct vision of the future work process, which determine what you do, as well as a list of long-term results. The second part briefly describes the strategies or types of activities that are used to achieve the goals. The values, vision and goals of NGOs are realized jointly and complement each other. Goals are based on a vision and must be weighed against values. Together they constitute a single bond that defines the identity of an NGO.

Since the activities of a non-governmental organization are aimed at the good of society, it must be accountable to society. Specifically, this includes accountability to stakeholders — sponsors, members, partners, the people you serve, the community in which you operate, and other NGOs. Different

stakeholders have different expectations. The sponsors expect the funds to be used effectively for their intended purpose to achieve the project's objectives. The people you work for expect you to help them solve problems and to treat them with respect. Partners want you to be honest and fulfill your obligations. And these are just a few examples. NGOs need to interact with and listen to different stakeholders to better understand different expectations.

When organizing its work, a non-profit organization should be guided by the provisions of the law in relation to the choice of goals both at the stage of preparation and adoption of statutory documents, and in the process of subsequent activities. At the same time, it is obvious that the law establishes broad formulations of goals that determine the main directions of socially significant activities, which the legislator recognizes as acceptable for a non-profit organization. For the practical management of each non-profit organization, it is required to specify the goals of its activities within the framework of the requirements of the law. In the context of managing an organization, there is a certain relationship between its mission and goals. If the mission sets general guidelines, directions for the functioning of the organization, expressing the meaning of its existence, then the specific final state to which the organization strives at each moment of time is fixed in the form of its goals.

One of the obstacles to the stable operation of many NPOs is that they work informally, without the principles, policies and procedures of the organization set out on paper. Often there is only a charter, but a charter alone is not enough.

For instance, Billis (1993) sees public sector governance principles as the beginning of organizational governance work, but continues to argue that third sector organizations have substantial systemic gaps that involve a range of new models and concepts, such as governance, transparency and evaluation. ... These models should be focused on new research and linked to the. As outlined in the previous section, the unique needs of third sector organizations are not necessarily "redesigned" from other sectors.

In a broad sense, the task of management in this case is to select such a structure that for a given period of time best meets the goals and objectives of the organization, as well as the internal and external factors affecting it. The best structure will be one that allows the organization to effectively interact with the

external environment, efficiently and efficiently distribute and direct the efforts of employees, and thus satisfy its customers and achieve its goals with maximum efficiency. Since the purpose of the organizational structure is to ensure that the organization's objectives are achieved, the design of the structure should be based on the strategic plans of the organization.

Non-profit organizations are not unique in this sense. Regardless of the area in which this or that non-profit organization works, it, as noted earlier, goes through certain stages of the life cycle. From the birth of an idea and the creation of a team, the establishment of an organizational structure, the acquisition of planning, design and fundraising skills through the establishment of accounting, an increase in the level of staff competence, the struggle for the image of their organization among the population, the search for a niche in the social services market, non-profit organizations achieve the status of a strong partner that is considered both the authorities and businessmen. They are well organized and know how to defend the interests of citizens and society. Starting from the stage of "rapid growth", NGOs are connected to networks where organizations of the same profile operate with them, or where they can receive knowledge, development experience and the necessary resources.

The connection between HRM and policy (Ogbonna and Whipp, 1999), Miles and Snow (1984) pointed to a certain correspondence. They said, like other scientists, that HRM is seen as a mandatory part of the strategy. The connection between them, however, is visible to Miles and Snow, demonstrating the HRM structure that corresponds to 3 of their 4 strategic forms. The similarity of the approach proposed by Miles and Snow can be said as follows:

1) advocates, companies with a narrow product strategy, they adhere to the "human resource building" approach with an emphasis on internal staff growth, promotion, entry-level executive recruitment, systematic research, and remuneration focused on the organizational hierarchy; 2) analysts, organizations operating in 2 business regions, 1 of which is reasonably calculated, and the other is converting respectively; 3) prospectors are group that regularly study the market and its potential opportunities, and play with multiple reactions to changes. They chide the "acquisition of human resources", buy, and reallocate employees at all stages every day. Formal research is minimal, but employees move into all

kinds of administrative and technical roles to ensure that experience and versatile responsibilities are acquired as needed; 4) reactors, organizations that rarely replace their own plan, even where they are needed to develop it.

It is also important to note that researchers, professionals, and advocates are more likely to choose HRM activities in non-profit organizations as a critical part of their own approach. This is because their HRM actually matches their respective tactics (Miles and Snow, 1984). Non-profit advocacy organizations should ensure that their HRM review covers employee retention, performance and efficiency rewards, training, and internal job growth characteristics that represent their reprimand for the success of current proposals. In terms of HRM, the main concern of HRM would be to continue the recruitment, growth and reallocation of human capital. There will be a rapid turnover of staff, according to their plan. In the calculated area of activity, the non-profit organization analyser will consider human capital management activities that are close to the activities of the prosecutor of non-profit organizations. HRM will consist of flexible team design, capacity development, intensive training, and a combination of recruitment and recruitment approaches in the emerging field of finance (Miles and Snow, 1984). It is also important to note that non-profit reactor organizations will become incompatible with their own policies towards them. As part of their own policies and future path, they will attribute a lower degree of value to HRM activities. In fact, this article says that Miles and Snow claim that spies, analyzers, and intermediaries are equally resilient in the same environment. The degree of importance of these HRM roles is then expected to lead to the strategic styles of non-profits, such as recruiting, research, pay, and labor relations. In fact, for example, it should be assumed that if a non-profit company works in the likeness of another of the first strategic organization, for example, from lawyer to consultant, as a minimum number, then certain HRM actions would be adjusted to show a new approach.

Proposal 1: The degree of importance of (a) hiring; (b) remuneration; (c) training; and (d) working relationships would be consistent with policies, i.e. strong or moderate for lawyers, practitioners, and academics in non-profit organizations.

Proposal 2: As strategic similarities change, non-profit agencies can simultaneously adjust their own recruitment, staffing, and training processes.

The study includes both quantitative and qualitative approaches with a similar status design process (Creswell, 1998). HRM is either in its infancy or completely absent from these organizations due to the small scale of most non-profit organizations in Canada (McMullen and Schellenberg, 2002). Which describes the vast body of evidence that is lacking, and the adoption of simplified measurements and statistical analyses rather than preparatory ones.

Organizationally, the participants in this sample were selected specifically for the research from a selection of non-profit organizations in each of the five provinces of Canada-Ontario, British Columbia, Alberta, Nova Scotia and Quebec: a) 2 or more employees; b) at least 2 years of work; c) the lowest budget of \$ 150,000. Target Recruitment services (Rudestam and Newton, 2001; Summer and Sommer, 1997) Executive directors were selected as individual members because they are likely to have experience with HRM and the operational environment. Initially, contacts were established with 502 non-profit organizations, but 270 were recognized as participants based on additional knowledge about the role of human resource management of the joint organization, 148 completed sample surveys were returned, 121 in the UK and 27 in French. 69 sample surveys were omitted due to a large number of insufficient results and zero responses in the reconstructed sample surveys. In particular, subject-oriented analysis has strengthened aspects of research problems focused on personal and ad hoc experiments of non-profit organizations (Sommer and Sommer, 1997).

There is a technique adapted by Zajac and Shortell (1989) in this essay that asks executive directors to define the strategic nuances of their non-profit organizations 5 or more years ago on a seven-point scale (see Appendix 1). To assess existing strategic proportions, this scale was also used. As Zajac and Shortell (1989) remember, their device for hospital classification is identical to Miles and Snow's original unit (1978).

Currently, it is believed that the prospectors the maximum number of programs would be added, following in the footsteps of the analyzers, and a lesser number would be introduced by the intercessors. The accepted wait analysis is basically what miners are doing.

The greatest number of services will be launched, followed by the analyzers' footsteps, and defenders will add less, but defenders have introduced more plans than analyzers.

The metric (Barrette and Carrie're, 2003) challenged executive directors to determine on a six-point scale how advanced and meaningful HR roles are for their organization's long-term performance. Shift in HR This metric reflects on the modification to recruiting, personnel and training procedures for this report. Scale, defined as the number of workers in non-profit organizations, was the control variable for the analysis. As a result, one-sided ANOVA illustrates that, based on the strategic categories of non-profit organizations; the number of workers does not vary. The relationship between size and strategic types discussed in H2 was small, with 2 percent of the dependent variable accounting for strategic types. Information Interpretation Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was conducted using the Chi-square procedure to test proposal 1, proposition 2. It is important to remember that the qualitative evidence from in-depth interviews and the resulting records were closely reviewed in order to define subjects relevant to the proposals for study.

The paper from Miles and Snow from 1978 examines the deep connections within human resource management. In particular, the Miles and Snow strategic typology was used for the analysis (Miles and Snow 1978). Miles and Snow's (1978) approach is focused around how organizations respond to three key issues. First, the entrepreneurial problem should determine the organization's expertise and skills available. Second, the engineering problem involves the design of the work, which requires an appropriate mix of staff and volunteers to provide services to non-profit organizations. Third, the administrative challenge requires human resources management to implement practices that increase employee awareness, competence, and commitment to organizational goals, with an emphasis on productivity and reducing uncertainty (Rodwell and Theo, 2004).

Miles and Snow (1978) suggested four strategic forms: protector, analyser, prospector and reactor. Each of these types has corresponding methods of human resource management, in contrast to the reactor. Miles and Snow (1978) believed that the reactor was not viable in the long term.

The strategic typology of Miles and Snow is an apt structure for researching the approach of human resource management in non-profit organizations, since it stresses the value of human resource management being attached to the three viable strategies. Their strategic typology is relevant for non-profit organizations. Nonprofit managers have come to understand more than ever that their approach will maximize effectiveness and ensure their organizations' sustainability.

Human resources management used in this research to define the structured management of interrelated functions such as recruiting, benefits, labor relations and training with the ultimate goal of achieving organizational objectives (Belcourt et al., 2002).

But also, I want to note that there are a number of organizations where strategy is not related to human resource management. The findings indicate that the importance of recruiting, wages and employee relations in non-profit organizations is not connected to their organizational strategy. These results are inconsistent with Miles and Snow (1984)'s findings that the strategic types of organizations will reflect human resources management. In respect of the value of HR management for the long-term survival of their company, the non-profit prospector, researcher, protector and reactor were not different. The findings, show that the importance of training varies between the prospector and defender nonprofits. According to Miles and Snow (1984), there is a significant connection between the importance of preparation, prospector, and defender strategies. To begin, a defender strategy would place a premium on training and internal career advancement, reflecting its focus on improving the efficacy of existing services. An analysis preparation approach will be similar to that of a defender. Finally yet importantly, obtain human capital from a prospector and implement a limited training program. This demonstrates the significance of training as a strategic HRM feature in NGOs.

One potential reason for the lack of relationship between human resources management and non-profit strategies is that for non-profits, the Miles and Snow system might not be optimal. There are important

inconsistencies between the structure, the organizational environment, and the strategic actions of non-profit organizations, similar to other management models that have been developed for profit organizations.

There are consequences for non-profit management and effectiveness due to the lack of association between recruiting, compensation and labor relations and non-profit approach styles. Recruitment is specifically related to the mission of charities, rather than other fields. Employees are primarily drawn, inspired and retained by the non-profit mission (Brown and Yoshioka, 2002), and, as McMullen and Schellenberg (2003a) noted, it takes serious attention to recruitment and retention to support the long-term human resources potential of non-profits.

A nonprofit organization will hire workers who do not have the requisite experience, skills, and abilities to execute the strategy, which puts the strategy at risk, if recruiting does not adapt with the strategy. Furthermore, if improvements in recruiting strategies do not reflect policy changes, non-profits may hire workers who do not support their strategic direction. Under these conditions, workers cannot buy into the change in policy or actually oppose it (Connell and Waring, 2002). If non-profits do not change their recruiting strategies at the same time as the plan shifts, existing workers will be disappointed because their new colleagues are not strategically focused. If preparation is not combined with a shift in policy, the workers are not prepared with the skills necessary to meet their strategic goals. Training is also unable to promote the task of creating the atmosphere that makes it possible.

The preponderance of temporary contract staff is considered crucial in determining whether non-profit organizations have a good chance of adopting an effective strategy. To give an example, if a non-profit organization is unable to recruit more full-time or part-time workers, organizations with a large number of temporary contract staff will lead to retention issues and loss of organizational memory (McMullen and Schellenberg, 2003a), factors that will reduce the effectiveness of any organizational strategy. High turnover also means that a non-profit repeat with each new group of workers the whole cycle of recruiting, placement, orientation and training (Akingbola, 2004), even when staffing is out of step with the strategic path.

It is important to stress that the human resources management assessments implemented here are exploratory. Most nonprofits in Canada, as mentioned above, have fewer than 20 paying workers (McMullen and Schellenberg, 2002) and operate without any form of skilled human resources management. This constitutes the restriction of human resources management exploration beyond its relevance to non-profit organizations. The findings should therefore be viewed with caution. However, in terms of lack of resources for administrative and support functions, the findings appear to be consistent with the capability issues of non-profit organizations (Hall et al., 2003).

On the basis of the knowledge alluded to above, it should be noted that, because human resources are their key asset, non-profit organizations cannot afford to fall behind their plans and, to a greater degree than in other industries, cannot be replaced by other resources. Furthermore, the success of strategy depends largely on the cooperation of human resources. In fact, it can be argued that, based on the expertise of their human resources, non-profit organizations can improve their strategies.

However, all these major works neglect to cover several challenges that every HR Management is facing in NGOs. Particularly, issues related to employment, career growth, and employee-to-employer relationships. There are several distinguishable challenges, which many HR employees have been noticed during their workplace. Rehema C. Batti from the Atlantic International University School of Management have conducted research and presented these issues and recommendations.

2.5. Human Resource: issues of local NGOs Management

Recruitment and Retention of Competent Staff

A lot of NGOs deal with projects with a short-term orientation, which means organization is not focusing on human resources and long-term training programs. Contractors are common in this type of NGO and is a common situation, when an employee is assigned to a task he is not qualified in, leaving before the end of the project. This leads to high turnover, and it can be a challenge for the core staff, and the NGO's performance for future growth. HR Management has issues in finding competent employees' who are willing to relocate to highly difficult geographical locations where NGOs are located.

Inadequate Human Resource Policies or Procedures

Staff Management is not supported in some NGOs' HR policies. Moreover, when they do exist, the institution uses it as a tool to require funds from donors. NGOs employ new workers randomly, without a proper job description and responsibility allocation. Several NGOs don't follow government policies on employment. As an example, an employee is given 20 days of vacation, but the government's standards it is 29 days. Additionally, a worker can be employed with no contract, so he/she can be fired without paid leave, or, in some cases, deducted from their salary.

Lack of Capacity to Manage a Diversity of Work Force

The issue of local NGOs is managed workplace of diverse employees. A lot of them face challenges in motivation and goal setting, as many groups require different approaches in managing staff. For instance, NGOs recently started actively employ the young generation, but it created tension between old and young workers. NGO neglected to delegate and ease the relationship between two groups, as they have one mission, and they were not competitors who will replace each other.

Mismatching of Employee Qualifications with Jobs or Positions

There were cases when an employee was placed in a position, he/she was not qualified in. For example, trained staff in catering was placed in the finance department. Some cases involved a new manager who did not have enough knowledge to supervise other workers effectively. This resulted in poor performance and miscommunication in the department.

Inadequate HR Management Skills among Supervisors

A lot of NGOs are not big in size; thus, they are put into groups of several local organizations. However, NGOs neglect to put the central HR unit, as it is expensive to facilitate. In these situations, NGOs handle the role of HR to staff with higher positions, such as project managers. This does not solve the problem, as managers are not trained to handle human resource day-to-day responsibilities. After some period, the conflict between workers could be a common occurrence.

Organization Program Strategies Affect Staffing

Some NGOs actively work with government institutions, international and local organizations with the new development opportunities. For that reason, HR in this NGOs recruit contract workers, project teams,

and restructure existing staff for maximum efficiency. Usually, NGOs is working with several organizations simultaneously, each of them implements different salaries, funds, and work management styles, which creates disagreements in a workplace. The Management also can have trouble, as given funds may be limited, and is not enough to hire additional workers. Therefore, existing staff are given these tasks, as a result having stress and underperformance.

Inability to Offer and Provide Competitive Employee

Incentives and Benefits. The issue of offering salary raises is one of the most common challenges for local NGOs, as it solely depends on financial resources that were given by their donors, or from enterprise activities taken by the NGO. It takes time and additional resources to offer competitive benefits, and it negatively effects on motivation and performance of the workforce.

Inadequate Performance Management Systems

It is a common practice for managers and staff to develop a set of targets and missions and allocate it for each employee. Despite that, NGO workers said that this practice does not exist in their workplace. It is not possible to assess staff performance without proper tools. But many instances showcased that the management would fire an employee due to “underperformance” with no evidence or performance sheet. The workplace is often confused about managers’ decision, and question what evidence they were fired. Many NGOs have a problem with performance culture, and it only decreases motivation and performance in the long-term.

Inadequate Career Development Opportunities

The career enhancement opportunities for the staff is another problem that many NGOs struggle to deal with. To succeed in this field, HR should constantly offer opportunities for career growth and keep the motivation of the workplace up. It used to be common for management to support the staff with training programs. However, today it became cost-inefficient, as many training recipients leave the company shortly after the training, before contributing and implementing given knowledge in practice. In cases when training was available, an employee, which should have been trained, would be neglected; HR instead would choose other staff or supervisor. In project-oriented NGOs, many job positions are contracts

or short-term staff, giving little room and reason to offer career development opportunities for the workers.

Difficulties in Maintaining Balance between Employee and Organization

NGOs face a challenge in balancing between organization's strategic plans and employees' needs. In many of these institutions' employees are dissatisfied over management's actions, as they were more concerned about donors' needs and projects. Employees in these organizations had low morale and did not fulfil the core targets of the NGO, as other stakeholders had more priority than they had. Additionally, people who had been working for an NGO for several years had difficulties working further in the company.

Lack Induction and Coaching Mechanisms for New Employees

A common situation in NGOs is related to the lack of clear guidelines and mentorship. NGOs recruit the staff with the idea that they should know their duties and have all skills, thus, expecting them to work effectively from day one. NGO fails to understand, that supervisors and managers should deliver necessary information for new employees. Many young people who were recently employed had complained, that NGO did not give them enough direction and responsibilities they should make on the daily basis. These instances created unrealistic demands for new staff, and the management mostly did not understand the core problems.

Presence of Leadership Gaps/Crisis

Many NGOs have leadership gaps and difficulties. If a manager's position is vacant, the organization struggles to fill that gap for several months or a year. Another problem lies in the management staff who had been in the organization since its beginning, making it difficult for other new managers to build leadership strategies. These NGO leaders tend to build technical aspects of their skills, but have no interest in the development of their leadership and strategic skills. As a result, in a long run, these institutions have a leadership vacuum.

Inadequate or Clear Structures for Rewarding Performance

The number of employees in NGOs felt that the management staff did not recognize the commitment and excellent performance of the staff. At the same time people with low effort and performances were ignored, as long as an employee is loyal to NGO, he/she can be safe from any complaints from the managers. This created tensions between hard-working staff and managers, as they felt their work are not appreciated and rewarded.

The human factor is one of the key organizational and structure factors for operating NGOs. Each of these problems requires a solution and optimization of the work process.

Development of appropriate guidelines or policies for human resources. The implementation of the goals and objectives of personnel management is carried out through the personnel policy. It is the main direction in work with personnel, a set of fundamental principles that are implemented by the personnel department of the enterprise. In this regard, personnel policy is a strategic line of conduct in the work with personnel. That is, organizations need to develop a detailed personnel policy that will reflect the existing organizational environment, and then go beyond developing a policy to institutionalize them.

Development of a personnel management plan related to the strategic focus of the organization. Organizations should primarily focus on human resource planning within the company. The project personnel management plan describes the general approach to team building, as well as to personnel management throughout the project and after its completion.

Developing mechanisms to support the identification, development and use of human resources. Shilpika (2012: 612) 9 supports the theory that people are undervalued, under-trained, under-utilized and under-motivated in many organizations and therefore perform much worse than they could without reaching their full potential. This step of creating mechanisms for supporting and motivating employees will help NGOs to competently implement a new information database for storing and tracking the potential of employees.

Conducting HR mentoring for board members and project managers. This is a solution to the problem of lack of people management skills among senior management. A simple step of conducting various trainings and master classes to acquire new skills of competent management.

Development and implementation of a personnel performance management system. First of all, this step implies motivation of employees, the introduction of incentives based on results (monetary or non-monetary forms) in local NGOs will be an excellent way of rallying and adhering to common goals and missions.

Development of management / leadership succession plans. Succession training is an effective means of optimizing the use of the organization's personnel, recruiting and relocating management personnel, ensuring leadership continuity, and on this basis, increasing the efficiency of the entire organization.

Development of a personnel risk management plan. The dominant role in the emergence of operational risk is played by the internal uncertainty of the company's functioning process, which is associated with the impossibility of accurately predicting human behavior in the process of work (human uncertainty), with the complexity of the technology used, (technical uncertainty) and with the desire of people to form social ties and groups, (social uncertainty). Considering all the risks in personnel management, NGO organizations should focus on minimizing risks and eliminating potential problems.

Outsourcing of HR functions. The budgets of small NGO organizations may not be large, and not everyone can afford to work with staff from the inside, for this step implies the involvement of third-party companies to keep records and structure the work of HR.

Creation of an annual matrix of organizational knowledge. This solution includes an objective assessment of the competence of personnel and work with deficiencies for mutual learning and exchange of experience, in order to avoid dependence on one person with "all" skills.

Periodic organizational assessment of personnel. This practice of conducting assessment activities for personnel will serve as an excellent totalizer for measuring the effectiveness of personnel management methods in NGO organizations.

Developing a strong internal organizational culture. Creating a supportive work environment for employees can be a great way to eliminate turnover in a specific environment like an NGO organization. A strong organizational culture can be an excellent foundation for employee motivation and commitment.

These are the challenges and their possible solutions, and every HR Department should consider them for a future growth of the organization.

CHAPTER 3: PRIMARY DATA

3.1. Fieldwork Analysis #1 and #2

For our further research, we used a targeted sample type to interview NGOs. A list from the website "Civil Initiatives Support Center (CISC)" used and two respondents were select. The means of communication were email mail. The respondents agreed to the interview and we sent them a consent form for the interview, where the points were mentioned that the name of the respondent and the name of the NGO would not appear, and the interview would be conducted anonymously. After receiving their consent, they set a date and time for an online meeting. The first respondent agreed to give an interview over the phone, and the second respondent offered an online meeting in the ZOOM platform.

Respondent #1 is the executive director of an NGO. The NGO is located in the city of Almaty, is engaged in the protection of the rights and interests of students. The sources of funding are social orders and grants. In 2020, the total budget was 16 mln tenge, and in 2019, the budget was approximately 5 mln tenge. And in 2018, it was about 7-8 mln tenge.

Respondent #2 is also the executive Director of an NGO based in the city of Atbasar. The organization deals with public monitoring issues. The state has been the main source of income for the last few years. We worked with organizations funded by foreign donors through partnerships. In 2020, the total budget was 12 mln tenge, of which 6 mln tenge from the CISC. And in 2019, the budget amounted to about 11 mln tenge, almost 100% of the allocated funds from the state. In 2018, about 12 mln tenge.

For the study, we used the Rehema C. Batti model. We analyzed the problems faced by local NGOs in the field of HRM.

Batti's first theory states that hiring and retaining competent workers is a problem for NGOs. Respondent's #1 and # 2 answers state the opposite. That they had no problems hiring and retaining competent employees. All employees come voluntarily.

The second problem is inadequate personnel policies or procedures. According to Batti's research, many NGOs do not have contracts or job descriptions. Respondent #1 explained this problem by the fact that students come to work voluntarily and they do not sign an employment contract, in most cases, they do

not receive a salary. However, the job responsibilities are described in detail. Respondent #2 claims that they sign a contract with employees, which describes the job responsibilities, terms, scope of work, and conditions. Analyzing the problem and the responses of the respondents, we can conclude that everything depends on the head and the activities of the NGO.

The next problem is the lack of capacity to manage the diversity of the workforce. For example, NGOs have recently started actively hiring the younger generation, but this has created tension between older and younger workers. The first organization did not face such a problem, since all of their employees are young. For them, the motivation is participation in various projects and the opportunity to participate in national competitions. And the second organization treats all employees equally. As mentioned above, all employees are voluntarily engaged. In addition, for them, the main motivation is to improve the quality of their lives and the lives of other people.

According to this Batti literature, the non-conformity of workers qualifications to jobs or positions is also an NGO problem. For example, trained food service personnel were placed in the finance department. Respondent #1 replied that they really do not have qualified employees, because the employees are students. Respondent #2 stated the opposite. He believes that it is very important to have qualified employees. In addition, that each employee has knowledge and experience with their field of activity. Analyzing the responses and the Batti model, we can say that everything also depends on the activities of the NGO and the manager.

Model Batti noted that the lack of HRM is also a major problem for NGOs. Many managers take on HRM responsibilities, but they are not trained to handle the day-to-day responsibilities of the staff, which leads to a conflict between workers after a while. Respondent #1 agreed that there are conflicts in organizations. For example, when projects are handed over at the wrong time. And the second respondent stated that there were no conflicts between employees at all. Both respondents said that they do not have HRM, and that they do not need it.

Batti believes that the organization's program strategies affect staffing. That is, when an organization works with different projects, and between employees who do the same work, but receive different

salaries, because the financing of projects is different, conflicts arise. However, the answers of both respondents show the opposite. They claim that there were no conflicts on this issue between the employees. Sometimes it turns out that the funding is not enough for the salary, but no one objected, because they initially want to help voluntarily.

Many NGOs are unable to offer competitive incentives or social packages for employees. Batti also raised the issue. It depends on the financial constraints. The respondents of our interview also agree with Batti. They are unable to create competitive incentives due to a lack of funding.

To achieve efficiency in the work of managers and employees, it is important to delegate responsibilities and tasks individually to each employee. Batti believes that this is problematic for NGOs. Many NGOs lack a performance management system, which makes it difficult to track performance. Regarding this question, respondents said that they have an efficiency management system, responsibilities and tasks are delegated individually to each employee.

Another problem in NGOs is the lack of career development. In project-oriented NGOs, many jobs are contracts or short-term staff, which gives little space and reason to provide employees with career opportunities. Respondents agree that there is no career growth.

NGOs face the challenge of balancing the organization's strategic plans with the needs of its employees. In many of these institutions, employees are dissatisfied with the actions of the management. Nevertheless, respondent #1 and #2 prove the opposite. They did not face such a problem.

A common situation in NGOs is the lack of clear guidelines and mentoring. However, the NGOs that we interviewed have a mentoring system and send employees to trainings and competitions to improve their skills. Mentors help new employees.

Many organizations face difficulties in hiring for leadership positions, and there are cases when this position remains vacant for a period of six months to one year. The first organization did not face such a problem. They select university students with leadership skills. The second organization also had no such problems.

According to Batti, inadequate or clear remuneration structures for work also remain a problem for NGOs. This created tension between hard-working employees and managers, as they felt that their work was not appreciated or rewarded. The interview respondents confirmed this theory. They do not have any penalties or rewards. Because the project budget is distributed in advance, and NGOs do not have the opportunity to give employees bonuses or fines.

3.2. Fieldwork Analysis #3 and #4

In this case, we used a targeted type of sample, which implies that we selected respondents for interviews from the website of the Center for Civil Initiatives. In our case, two respondents were selected. In my case, the interview was semi-structured, since we had some freedom between questions, some questions smoothly came out of others, there were also transitions.

Brief profile of the organization: Respondent #3 organization is engaged in promoting an active lifestyle in the city, organizing sports competitions, both amateur and professional. In the interview, we were able to touch upon the issues of the organization's internal regulations, the employee motivation system and also the HR component of the organization, we analyzed a small case. The interview was conducted via the WhatsApp messenger, where we were able to call and our conversation took about 30 minutes. Our entire conversation was recorded and also translated into text format. The organization did not require any nondisclosure papers, they were very open and welcoming, and they answered almost all the questions I asked.

Respondent #3 is a school with a military bias. It is worth noting that in almost every large city of the Republic of Kazakhstan there are from one or more similar schools, which are under the control of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan. My dialogue with the representative of this NGO took place by means of audio messages, due to the fact that the person had little free time, but successfully managed to solve all the issues.

I would like to note that, in this case, both organizations refused to disclose their sources of funding.

This study was carried out for a comparative analysis of the consolidated data between the work of Rehema C. Batti, who described the human resource management problems faced by local NGOs and the

reality that is happening in our country today. The interview helped to look at existing NGOs using a real example, and many of Batti's theories were applied in the course of the questions I asked. Below I will try to describe all the insights that I drew during the dialogue with the organizations

1. The absence of an HR department, thereby confirming one of Batti's theories that managers lack talent management skills and, in fact, lack of talent to carry out this work. In my 2 organizations, the headquarters were small and they did not consider it necessary to have such personnel. : (Human Capital Theory, Batti)
2. According to Batti that new employees do not have any instructions and can delegate several projects in the organization, work not according to their qualifications and specialties, but according to the examples of my organizations, they have their own job descriptions, which clearly spell out all the duties of employees and the positions they hold. (Role Behavior Theory)
3. In the Respondent #3 organization, the recruitment of employees is sometimes supplemented during any major sporting events and also finishes work with them upon their completion. In the organization Respondent #4, they mainly work stably, as they are an educational institution.
4. Both NGOs are unable to provide their employees with social insurance, due to the limited budget and grants being awarded. This can sometimes lead to a decrease in the efficiency and motivation of some employees.
5. It was said about career growth in the organization, but we could not explain it more specifically, but based on our dialogue, this issue was apparently perceived as career growth in NGO organizations as a whole. That is, gaining the necessary experience to work in subsequent ones.

3.3. Fieldwork Analysis #5 and #6

For this research purposive sampling was used, an expert's opinions and experience on NGOs were the main purposes of the interview. The respondents signed a consent form for data usage, but some of them remained anonymous. Thus, we used to make up names for the analysis. The first person is Respondent #5. She is working in the NGO for 20 years as a director. The organization's main goal is to assist elderly people in finding a job, helps financially, and support them in many ways. The main funding sources are

Government orders, grants, and international organizations. The yearly budget is not stable, around 15 to 30 million tenge every year. The second respondent is Respondent #6, who is working as an accountant for 9 years in an NGO with a very diverse profile. This NGO is related to promoting the Kazakh language, development of KVN, prosper creative abilities of young kids, fostering national identity among young individuals. The main source of funding is Akimat of the Nur-Sultan, governmental funding. The budget is around 30 million tenge yearly. The interviews were conducted online by telephone calls and text messages, and structured questions and responses were implemented for the research.

The questions for the analysis were constructed by C. Batti's work on challenges of NGOs Human Resource Management. The first question was related to recruiting new and retention of competent workers. Respondent #5 and #6 said they did not have any problem with this challenge. The recruitment was conducted by selecting candidates through web-sites and an employment center. The second question was whether candidates signed contracts before applying for a job. Respondents said that all employees have valid contracts and that this is a mandatory procedure for any organization. The responsibilities and duties also were clearly established in the mentioned contracts. On the question on NGOs career development for workers, Respondent #6 said yes, while Respondent #5 responded partly, due to financial limitations. Managing diversity in the workforce can be an issue, and many organizations use various strategies to bind employees to work together. The obstacles might be the age gap, different cultures in the workplace. Both Respondents reported that to avoid these obstacles their NGOs value motivation, experience, and policies equal for all employees. On the question regarding appropriate employee qualification, Respondent #6 said that their main criteria for employment are certificates and degrees in the field they applying for a job for. Respondent #5, on the other hand, reported that NGOs deals with people coming from Employment Centre, who have different degrees and experience. As Batti said, there could be instances of mismatching an individual's qualifications and the job description. This leads to underperformance and a decrease in motivation. Therefore, this organization has a more diverse workplace. The next set of questions were related to Management staff and their responsibilities. Recruitment of employees for management positions was not an issue for both NGOs. On the question of

whether they had conflicts and misunderstandings between workers in the workplace respondents said there were such occurrences. Additionally, for the question on existence HR Department or HR Manager NGO's representatives responded negatively. In the research conducted by Batti, it is typical that NGOs lack of HR Department, which became standard implementation in companies and governmental structures decades ago. Many NGOs work with several projects simultaneously, which are supported by different organizations and findings. This creates a disparity between salaries employees. When asking this question, Respondent #5 #6 said that they did not have any issues with that, as they clearly stated the salary distribution in the contracts. This is a common strategy to set a specific salary distribution to avoid any complaints. Furthermore, when it comes to punishment and rewards for a contributed output in the workplace, both of them said there is no option due to limited budget, and they control the short-term output to find if any of the workers have difficulties in the project, without major penalization. C. Batti considers inadequate management feedback as one of the challenges for a healthy workforce performance. Similarly, NGOs do not have the option of distributing social packages, medical healthcare due to financial constraints. This only solidifies the need for proper funding options, as medical care should be a priority in a modern world. On the question on delegation of the job duties for the day and week, these NGOs typically delegate individually. More than often successful organization has set team goals, cases, and weekly targets. Individual performance is important, but without team collaboration, the NGO will have trouble embracing the performance culture of the employees. The challenge of maintaining the balance between Employee and Organization needs is one of the main issues in many organizations, NGOs included. When asking how they deal with this occurrence, respondents mentioned that they should be transparent and maintain well-made agreements and policies. All interviewees agreed that professional development training and programs are an important asset for the organization, but it is expensive to establish. The lack of proper career development opportunities, as Batti has noted about the inadequate management, this will damage the motivation to stay in a company longer and develop as a specialist. Moreover, every respondent positively views the role of a mentor in every organization. Despite that, not every organization has mentors for new workers. The question on what they value in the candidate, most

interviewees have similar answers such as motivation, skills, degree. As a result, these NGOs struggle with providing social packages, medical healthcare insurance, and training. The absence of HR Management damages the NGOs in the long-term, as many employees work on contracts, and have no incentive to stay with the organization further. HR Department could assist in supporting with career coaching, mentoring, and career development opportunities. Despite that, currently, NGOs are struggling with these incentives.

3.4. Fieldwork Analysis #7 and #8

For 2 weeks, we conducted field research regarding our topic. First of all, we interviewed the primary sources of news stories in the field of NGOs. At the heads and chairmen of non-profit organizations. I interviewed two representatives of the NGO who were directly the chairmen and directors of the organization. We received contact information on the official and public website of the Center for Civil Initiatives, where a large list of large and small NGOs operating at the moment is provided. I opted for two organizations and contacted them first by e-mail, where, after leaving their contacts, they gave their consent to the processing of data.

The seventh organization is a student association that is engaged in creating conditions for the effective implementation of the intellectual, creative, spiritual, innovative potential of student youth of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The main goal of the Republican student's activity (hereinafter referred to as organization # 7) is to form the public consciousness of NGOs as an organization that really solves the legal, socio-economic and everyday problems of student youth and youth. Actively participates in the formation of independent Kazakhstan. I scheduled an interview with the president of this NGO in an online format (on the Zoom platform), where we had an almost hour-long conversation remotely, during which I recorded our conversation on an audio medium, and then with the help of it I could easily transfer it to text format. The organization did not require any papers on non-disclosure or commercial secrets; they entered into a dialogue with me very easily, were friendly and shared the information I needed.

The eighth organization is a center of initiatives based in the city of Kyzylorda (hereinafter referred to as organization # 8), which covers a wide range of work and assistance to the population, but the main task

and mission is to help vulnerable groups in employment and obtain specialization. They work not only on the territory of Kazakhstan, but also on other CIS countries. While doing community work, they raise funding, not only from local institutions and from businesses, but also work with foreign donors. Our dialogue with the chairman of this NGO, as well as with the first respondent, took place online, on the Zoom platform.

We conducted this study for a comparative analysis of the summary of data between the work of Professor Rehema C. Batti, Professor of the School of Management, Atlantic International University, on the problems of human resource management facing local NGOs and the real picture of the social activities taking place on the market in our country. The interviews conducted gave us the opportunity to see and compare the data on the example of operating non-profit organizations. In the dialogue, we asked questions regarding a number of Batti's theories about the organizational structure and ecosystem of NGOs. Below I will give some vivid examples of confirmation or non-confirmation of Batti's theories.

First, and I think the most important, it is worth noting that there is no HR unit in the staff of the NGO. This confirms Batti's theory of inadequate talent management skills among executives and the lack of the right talent for the job. Both organizations in which I conducted the analysis were small and did not have such an extensive personnel policy. The official permanent staff consisted of 8-10 people, the management and recruitment of which was carried out directly by the leader himself.

The second problem is inadequate personnel policies or procedures. As Batti said, NGOs recruit new employees randomly, without proper job descriptions and responsibilities. Some NGOs do not comply with government employment policies. And it is also worth noting the delegation of responsibilities and the performance of work by employees who do not have the proper qualifications. For example, in organization No. 7, one employee could supervise 2-3 areas at once, such as marketing and legal issues. Although, in fact, the employee was qualified only in jurisprudence, however, issues and responsibilities regarding the promotion and maintenance of pages on social networks were also delegated to him. Which once again confirms Batti's theory.

Both organizations, when asked about problems in hiring new and retaining competent workers, highlighted the turnover that is inherent in NGOs. Given the lack of ongoing and ongoing funding, staff turnover is justified. Since most of the employees are hired for a certain period of validity of the contract with the donors, upon the expiration of which the employment contract with the employee is also terminated. Organization # 8 noted that projects do not always appear stably one after another, there are periods when they are not. And keeping employees on staff is not profitable, and due to the lack of projects, staff turnover occurs.

Nevertheless, it is also worth revealing the problem that according to Batti's theory, career opportunities for employees are another problem that many NGOs are trying to cope with. However, both respondents in the dialogue noted that employees working in the field of NGOs have the opportunity for career growth and development, they also gave several vivid examples of how they themselves or their employees have grown professionally, working specifically in non-profit organizations. Having the opportunity of continuous experience of working with large projects, constant advanced training and the availability of extensive trainings and coaching, employees working hard will always be able to achieve success in the professional field.

3.6. Fieldwork Analysis #9 and #10

For further research, we used the target sample type for the NGO in-depth interview. The study was conducted for two weeks. The list of NGO leaders and experts was selected on the website of the Center for Support of Civil Initiatives. The means of communication was e-mail, as well as the contact phone numbers listed on the site. Of the five selected respondents, only two responded and agreed to an online interview. To guarantee anonymity, I mailed them a consent form for the interview. After both respondents sent their personal numbers by contacting us, we set a date and time for the online interview. The respondents were open and polite to me and agreed to answer all my questions immediately over the phone, our conversation lasted about 20 minutes. Since this study guarantees anonymity, I will list the names of the two employees and managers interviewed as respondent #9 and respondent #10. Respondent #9 is the director of an NGO. The public organization is located in the city of Kostanay, is engaged in

the protection of the rights and interests of consumers. The source of funding is only one-the grant won. Respondent #10 is the head of a public association in Aktobe. The subject of the organization's activities is the provision of social services and the implementation of various preventive measures to promote a healthy lifestyle. The manager decided not to disclose the source of funding. The analysis was conducted using the theory of Rehema C. Batti, comparing everything related to the problems faced by local NGOs in the field of human resource management. According to Batti's theory, attracting and retaining competent workers is a challenging task for NGOs. According to the survey, the answer of one of the respondents confirms this theory, and the answer of the second, on the contrary, refutes this theory. The reason for the problem of hiring and retaining employees is, as the respondent replied, precisely low wages and a large amount of work. Also, according to Batti's theory, the problem is an inadequate personnel policy. Because, in theory, many NGOs do not have contracts or job descriptions. The most important thing that I noted for myself is that local NGOs do not have a human resources manager. Many managers take on the responsibilities of human resources management, but they are not trained to perform the day-to-day duties of the staff, which after a while leads to conflict between employees. This complicates the procedure. After interviewing the respondents, they confirmed that they really do not have specific instructions. Respondent #9 says that when applying for a job, he recruited his friends who simply agreed to take responsibility for the project. There were no conflicts among themselves on this issue. Respondent #10 claims that they enter into a contract with employees that describes their job responsibilities. But at the same time, there were conflicts with the issue of wages, since not everyone did what was required under the contract, but the salary was the same. Analyzing the responses of the respondents, the conclusion was confirmed: according to Batti's theory, there is a certain problem with the personnel policy.

The third problem is the lack of ability to manage the diversity of the workforce. According to this theory, after interviewing the respondents, I realized that one of them does not have such a problem. Since when hiring employees in NGOs, respondent #9 replied that, both the younger generation and the older ones are actively involved. The second organization did not face such a problem, since all its employees belong

to the older generation. The young people did not want to work for a penny, or even free. As mentioned above, all employees are volunteers. For them, the main motivation is to successfully complete and close the project, helping people free. However, it is also worth noting that Batti's theory suggests that career opportunities for employees are another problem that many NGOs are trying to solve. However, both respondents noted during the dialogue that employees working in the field of NGOs have the opportunity for career growth and development, and gave several vivid examples of how they themselves or their employees grew professionally working in non-profit organizations.

CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSIONS

The aim of this research was to identify the management challenges faced by local non-profit organizations. In so doing based on analysis of secondary data the key aspects of NGOs management challenges theoretical framework was suggested. This was also used to analyse the primary data. Here are the key findings:

The literature states that hiring and retaining competent workers is a problem for NGOs. However, the research showed mixed findings: first, state the opposite. That they had no problems hiring and retaining competent employees. All employees come voluntarily. Thus, volunteering is the key HRM entrance policy. However, this raises the issue of contract signing with volunteers in the volunteering stage. Additionally, some NGOs note that the challenges with hiring the experienced leadership positions which echoes the point of literature. Yet some NGOs still hire young university graduates with leadership skills to fill the management challenge.

The second problem is inadequate personnel policies or procedures. According to literature, many NGOs do not have contracts or job descriptions. Respondent #1 explained this problem by the fact that students come to work voluntarily and they do not sign an employment contract, in most cases, they do not receive a salary. Analyzing the problem and the responses of the respondents, we can conclude that everything depends on the head and the activities of the NGO.

The next problem is the lack of capacity to manage the diversity of the workforce. For example, NGOs have recently started actively hiring the younger generation, but this has created tension between older and younger workers.

According to literature, the non-conformity of workers qualifications to jobs or positions is also an NGO problem. The research showed the lack of HRM is also a major problem for NGOs. Many managers take on HRM responsibilities, but they are not trained to handle the day-to-day responsibilities of the staff, which leads to a conflict between workers after a while. Respondent #1 agreed that there are conflicts in organizations.

According to the literature the next management challenge was that the organization's program strategies affect staffing. That is, when an organization works with different projects, and between employees who do the same work, but receive different salaries, because the financing of projects is different, conflicts arise. However, our findings show the opposite. there were no conflicts on this issue between the employees. Sometimes it turns out that the funding is not enough for the salary, but no one objected, because they initially want to help voluntarily.

Another problem in NGOs is the lack of career development. In project-oriented NGOs, many jobs are contracts or short-term staff, which gives little space and reason to provide employees with career opportunities. Respondents agree that there is no career growth.

According to Batti, inadequate or clear remuneration structures for work also remain a problem for NGOs. This created tension between hard-working employees and managers, as they felt that their work was not appreciated or rewarded. The interview respondents confirmed this theory. They do not have any penalties or rewards. Because the project budget is distributed in advance, and NGOs do not have the opportunity to give employees bonuses or fines.

According to Batti that new employees do not have any instructions and can delegate several projects in the organization, work not according to their qualifications and specialties, but according to the examples of my organizations, they have their own job descriptions, which clearly spell out all the duties of employees and the positions they hold.

The next point was the reviewed literature considers inadequate management feedback as one of the challenges for a healthy workforce performance. Similarly, NGOs do not have the option of distributing social packages, medical healthcare due to financial constraints. This only solidifies the need for proper funding options, as medical care should be a priority in a modern world. On the question on delegation of the job duties for the day and week, these NGOs typically delegate individually. More than often successful organization has set team goals, cases, and weekly targets. Individual performance is important, but without team collaboration, the NGO will have trouble embracing the performance culture of the employees. The challenge of maintaining the balance between Employee and Organization needs

is one of the main issues in many organizations, NGOs included. When asking how they deal with this occurrence, respondents mentioned that they should be transparent and maintain well-made agreements and policies. All interviewees agreed that professional development training and programs are an important asset for the organization, but it is expensive to establish. The lack of proper career development opportunities, as Batti has noted about the inadequate management, this will damage the motivation to stay in a company longer and develop as a specialist. Moreover, every respondent positively views the role of a mentor in every organization. Despite that, not every organization has mentors for new workers. The question on what they value in the candidate, most interviewees have similar answers such as motivation, skills, degree. As a result, these NGOs struggle with providing social packages, medical healthcare insurance, and training. The absence of HR Management damages the NGOs in the long-term, as many employees work on contracts, and have no incentive to stay with the organization further. HR Department could assist in supporting with career coaching, mentoring, and career development opportunities. Despite that, currently, NGOs are struggling with these incentives.

Both organizations, when asked about problems in hiring new and retaining competent workers, highlighted the turnover that is inherent in NGOs. Given the lack of ongoing and ongoing funding, staff turnover is justified. Since most of the employees are hired for a certain period of validity of the contract with the donors, upon the expiration of which the employment contract with the employee is also terminated.

In 2020, the global COVID-19 pandemic was declared. The global pandemic has damaged many organizations and small businesses. They had to temporarily stop working, and some even closed permanently. But there were also positive aspects for some organizations.

A respondent in the field of elderly assistance mentioned that it was a challenge to support them during the pandemic as they and the government were not prepared for this crisis, but now these organizations are prioritized and have a solid budget, as there is a higher risk for elderly people to suffer from COVID-19.

Volunteer organizations, for example, have also briefly halted their operations. However, they did assist poor families who had lost their jobs due to the country's declared quarantine.

4.1. Recommendations

1. Primarily in local NGOs, the implementation of results-based rewards would be an excellent way of rallying and adhering to shared goals and missions.
2. To improve the quality of the work of NGOs and their further functioning, we recommend increasing the number of state competitions and grants.
3. The development of the identification of employees and adequate utilization of workforce capacity should be a priority for the NGO. This will improve the productivity of employees, and foster their motivation in the workplace.
4. First of all, the operating NGOs in our country should begin to regulate more stringently the legal and regulatory issues of keeping records of human resources in order to avoid high turnover and social issues that have arisen.
5. For the subsequent work and formation of NGOs in Kazakhstan, it is recommended to hold charity seminars to increase the abilities of employees.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Buxton, C. (2011). *The struggle for civil society in Central Asia*. Sterling: Kumarian Press.
2. Makhmutova, M., & Akhmetova, A. (2011). *Civil Society in Kazakhstan*. Almaty: Civicus.
3. Kabdiyeva Aliya (2013) *Developing Sustainable NGOs in Kazakhstan*. KIMEP University, Almaty, Kazakhstan. Canadian Center of Science and Education.
4. Miles, R.E. and Snow, C.C. (1978) *Organizational Strategy, Structure, and Process*. San Francisco, CA: McGraw-Hill.
5. Miles, R.E. and Snow, C.C. (1984) 'Designing Strategic Human Resource Systems', *Organizational Dynamics*, 13(1): 36 – 52.
6. Ogbonna, E. and Whipp, R. (1999) 'Strategy, Culture and HRM: Evidence from the UK Food Retailing Sector', *Human Resource Management Journal*, 9(4): 75 – 90.
7. Zajac, E.J. and Shortell, S.M. (1989) 'Changing Generic Strategies: Likelihood, Direction, and Performance Implications', *Strategic Management Journal*, 10: 413 – 30.
8. Sommer, B. and Sommer, R. (1997) *A Practical Guide to Behavioral Research: Tools and Techniques*. New York: Oxford University Press.
9. USAID, (2011). *CSO Sustainability Index. Kazakhstan*. Retrieved from http://transition.usaid.gov/locations/europe_eurasia/dem_gov/ngoindex.
10. LONGMAN, *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English Online* <https://www.ldoceonline.com/dictionary/ngo>
11. LEXICO, *Oxford English and Spanish Dictionary, Synonyms, and Spanish to English Translator* https://www.lexico.com/definition/third_sector
12. Diachenko, S. (2008). *The government and NGOs in Kazakhstan: Strategy, forms, and mechanisms of cooperation*. CA&CC Press, Sweden. Retrieved from <http://www.ca-c.org/online/05.dyaeng.shtml>.
13. Ruffin, M. (2011). Introduction. In *Civil Society in Central Asia* (pp. 3-26). University of Washington Press.

14. Zhu, Hongjin, Wang, Pengji, and Bart, Chris (2016) *Board processes, board strategic involvement, and organizational performance in for-profit and non-profit organizations*. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 136 (2). pp. 311-328.
15. Heap et al. (2000). Emerging NGO-business relations in Central Asia. *INTRAC, Occasional Papers Series*, 33, 1-54.
16. Cooper, J. (2011). The Real Work: Sustaining NGO Growth in Central Asia. In *Civil Society in Central Asia* (pp. 214-228). University of Washington Press.
17. Benevene, P., & Cortini, M. (2010). Human resource strategic management in NPOs. An explorative study on managers' psychosocial training. *Journal of Workplace Learning*, 22(8), 508-521. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/13665621011082873>.
18. Abdusalyamova, L., & Warren, H. (2007). *Organisational Capacity Building in Central Asia: Reflections from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan*. INTRAC. Praxis Paper, 15, 1-48
19. Etzioni, A. (1961) *A Comparative Analysis of Complex Organisations: On Power, Involvement and their Correlates*, New York: The Free Press of Glencoe.
20. Najam, A. (1996) 'Understanding the Third Sector: Revisiting the Prince, the Merchant and the Citizen'. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 7:2 pp203 – 19.
21. Peters, T. J. and Waterman, R. H. (1982) *In Search of Excellence*, New York: Harper & Row.
22. Walton, R. E. (1985) 'From Control to Commitment in the Workplace'. *Harvard Business Review*, 63:2 pp77 – 85.
23. Paton, R. (1999) 'The Trouble with Values' in D. Lewis (ed.) *International Perspectives on Voluntary Action: Reshaping the Third Sector*. London: Earthscan.
24. Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020), *Number of NGO's by region as of a April 2020*
<https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/qogam/documents/details/42741?lang=en&searchText=%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D1%82%D0%B2%D0%BE%20%D0%BD%D0%BF%D0%BE&slug=qogam>

25. Committee for Civil Society Affairs of the Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020). *Non-Governmental Organization Grant Plan 2017*.
<https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/akk/documents/details/26647?lang=en>
26. Committee for Civil Society Affairs of the Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020). *Grant Provision Plan for NGOs for 2018*.
<https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/akk/documents/details/26657?lang=en>
27. Committee for Civil Society Affairs of the Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020). *NGO Grant Plan 2019*.
<https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/akk/documents/details/19771?lang=en>
28. Committee for Civil Society Affairs of the Ministry of Information and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2020). *NGO Grant Plan 2020*.
<https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/qogam/documents/details/57326?lang=en>
29. Soros Foundation-Kazakhstan (last updated). *Grants database*.
https://www.soros.kz/ru/grants/grants_awarded/
30. National Endowment for Democracy (last updated). *Kazakhstan 2018*.
<https://www.ned.org/region/eurasia/kazakhstan-2018/>
31. National Endowment for Democracy (last updated). *Kazakhstan 2019*.
<https://www.ned.org/region/eurasia/kazakhstan-2019/>
32. National Endowment for Democracy (last updated). *Kazakhstan 2020*.
<https://www.ned.org/region/eurasia/kazakhstan-2020/>
33. Eurasia Foundation of Central Asia in Kazakhstan (last updated). *Grants Committed*. http://ef-ca.kz/granty_i_tendery/vydelennye_granty
34. Rehema C. Batti. *Human Resource Management Challenges Facing Local NGOs. Humanities and Social Sciences*. Vol. 2, No. 4, 2014, pp. 87-95. doi: 10.11648/j.hss.20140204.11

35. Khavul, Susanna; Benson, George S.; and Datta, Deepak K.(2009) "*HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND INTERNATIONAL NEW VENTURES FROM EMERGING MARKETS*,"
Frontiers of Entrepreneurship Research:
36. Adair John Eric (2011) *The John Adair Lexicon of leadership. The definitive guide to leadership skills and knowledge*. London. Kogan Page.
37. De Graaf, M. (1987) '*Context, Constraint or Control? Zimbabwean NGOs and their Environment*'. Development Policy Review, 5 pp277 – 301.
38. Fowler, A. (1997) *Striking a Balance: A Guide to Enhancing the Effectiveness of NGOs in International Development*, London: Earthscan.
39. Koenig, B. (1996) '*The Management of International Non-Governmental Organisations in the 1990s*'. Transnational Associations, 2 pp66 – 72.
40. Korten, D. C. (1987) '*Third Generation NGO Strategies: A Key to People-Centred Development*'. World Development, 15 (Supplement) pp145 – 59.
41. Lewis, D. (1998) '*Development NGOs and the Challenge of Partnership: Changing Relations between North and South*'. Social Policy and Administration, 32:5 pp501 – 12.
42. Lewis, D. and Wallace, T. eds (2000) *New Roles and Relevance: Development NGOs and the Challenge of Change*, Hartford: Kumarian.
43. Mukasa, S. (1999) '*Are Expatriate Staff Necessary in International Development NGOs? A Case Study of an NGO in Uganda*'. International Working Paper No. 4, Centre for Civil Society, London School of Economics.
44. Parker, B. (1998) *Globalization and Business Practice: Managing across Boundaries*, London: Sage Publications.
45. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2020, September 1). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development 2019*.
<http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/doklad-nko-2020.pdf>

46. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2018, August 30). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development* 2018.
[http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/soprovod-doklad-2019-\(fajl-otobrazheniya\)-\(1\).pdf](http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/soprovod-doklad-2019-(fajl-otobrazheniya)-(1).pdf)
47. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2017, August 31). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development* 2017.
<http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/doklad-2018.pdf>
48. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2016, August 31). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development* 2016.
<http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/doklad-2017-skan.pdf>
49. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2015, August 31). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development* 2015.
[http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/2015-doklad-\(1\)-compressed\(1\).pdf](http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/2015-doklad-(1)-compressed(1).pdf)
50. Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (2015, August 29). *Social Oriented Non-Governmental Organisation Development* 2014.
[http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/2014-doklad-\(1\)-compressed.pdf](http://nko.economy.gov.ru/upload/docs/2014-doklad-(1)-compressed.pdf)
51. Olga Buharova, O. B. (2013, February 12). Volunteer score: *Nonprofits will vie for federal subsidies*. Rossiskaya Gazeta. <https://rg.ru/2013/02/12/nko.html>
52. Rossiskaya Gazeta (2011, September 29). *The support program for socially oriented non-profit organisations*.
http://old.economy.gov.ru/minec/activity/sections/socorientnoncomorg/doc20110929_6
53. Golos Ameriki. (2005, November 18). *NGO problems in Russia: expert opinions*.
<https://www.golosameriki.com/a/a-33-2005-11-18-voa5/638317.html>
54. James Goldgeier and Michael McFaul, “*Russia’s No Democracy. So What?*” Washington Post, 9.04.2006, p. B02.
55. Mary Dejevsky, “*Russia’s NGO Law: The Wrong Target,*” in Opendemocracy.net (также воспроизведено в: Johnson’s Russia List, no. 9319, 16.12.2005);

56. Nicolai Petro, *"Russian NGO Legislation is a Step in the Right Direction,"* Russiaprfile.org.
57. Federal News Service, op. ci. George E. Hudson, *"Civil Society in Russia: Models and Prospects for Development."* *The Russian Review* 62 (April 2003): 212-222, p. 214; Russell J. Dalton. *Citizen Politics* (New York: Chatham House, 2002. 3-е изд.), p. 46.
58. Nicolai N. Petro. *Crafting Democracy: How Novgorod Has Coped with Rapid Social Change* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2004), p. 52.
59. Freedom House, *"Press Release."* December 20, 2004

Was developed and provided

1. Name:
2. Position:
3. How long he/she works.
4. Organization:
5. What is mission of organization?
6. Target audience:
7. Do you have issues with the recruitment of new staff and retention of competent workers?
8. Do all employees sign a contract when applying for a job?
9. Were your responsibilities and duties detailed and clear in the employee's contract?
10. Does your NGO provide career development opportunities?
11. What approaches do you use to motivate employees of different ages? ((How to motivate old and young employees?))
12. Are all of your employees qualified in their field of work? If yes, why is it important?
13. Have you faced the challenges of recruiting employees for leadership positions?
14. The research shows that in every organization, as well as in the family, there are conflicts, are there conflicts in your organization?
15. Is there an HR unit in your organization?
16. How do you resolve conflicts of interest within the organization related to the implementation of different working methods and salaries when the NGO is working on several projects at the same time?
17. Are there penalties and remuneration in wages for those employees in NGOs who show excellent or poor results?
18. Does your organization have the ability to provide employees with incentives and social packages? If not, is it due to financial constraints?

19. For successful management, do you delegate goals and responsibilities individually to each employee?
20. Do you have training courses to improve the skills of your employees?
21. Do you think that professional development training has a positive impact on employee satisfaction and motivation?
22. Do you have a mentoring system in your organization?
23. Does mentoring young NGO staff to determine the direction of your career?
24. What are your staff requirements? Do you have clear guidelines for the work of your employees?
25. Funding sources?
26. Total budget amount for the year?